

MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MEETING

**November 13, 2007
City Manager Conference Room
300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove
4:00 p.m.**

Tape: 07-21

Boardmembers Present: Jeff Becom
Darlene Billstrom
Scott Hall
Ken Hinshaw
Doug Howe, Vice Chair
Maryanne L. Spradling
Dennis Tarmina, Chair (arrived before item 11b)

Staff: Garcia, Stains-Ramp and Wotan

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

On a motion by Hall-Billstrom, the Board voted 6-0, to approve the minutes of the October 23, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting.

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

None.

3. COMMUNICATIONS

None.

4. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

None.

5. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS

Staff Reported.

6. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS

Staff reported.

7. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

8. ITEMS WITHDRAWN

None.

9. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE

a. Project Address: 180 Central Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3675-07 for a proposed two-story duplex with an attached two-car garage. (Applicant: Tom Calvert)

Project Address: *105 Monterey Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3716-07 for a proposed exterior alteration to an existing single-family dwelling that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Joe McNair, Williams Roofing Co.)

Project Address: 149 15th Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3728-07 for a proposed remodel and second-story addition to an existing single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Jeffrey Becom)

Project Address: 747 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3718-07 for a proposed remodel and second-story addition to an existing single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Phoebe Richbourg)

On a motion by Billstrom-Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0, with Becom abstaining from voting on 149 15th Street, to continue 105 Monterey Street and 747 Ocean View Boulevard to the November 27, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting, and 180 Central Avenue and 149 15th Street to the December 11, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting.

10. CONSENT AGENDA

On a motion by Billstrom-Spradling, the Board voted 6-0 to move items 11.l. 427 Evergreen Road, 11.n., 465 Gibson Avenue, and 11.r., 1223 Funston Avenue to the consent agenda.

Project Address: 427 Evergreen Road

Architectural Approval Application No. 3700-07 for a proposed remodel and first and second-story additions to an existing one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Ed Bredthauer, Architect)

Project Address: 465 Gibson Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3669-07 for a proposed demolition of an existing garage and construction on a detached garage. (Applicant: Eric Miller, Architects)

Project Address: 1223 Funston Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3719-07 for a proposed exterior alteration to a detached covered parking structure associated with a single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Maurice Bernier)

On a motion by Becom-Hall, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the consent agenda. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

a. Project Address: 635 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3727-07 (Final) for proposed exterior alterations to an existing commercial building. (Applicant: Jeanne C. Byrne, FAIA)

b. Project Address: 168 Central Avenue

Sign Permit Application No. 07-1048 for proposed signage for a new business. (Applicant: Michelle Jeffries)

c. Project Address: 726 Hillcrest Avenue

Amend Architectural Approval No. 3626-06 for a proposed roofing material change for a remodel and addition to an existing single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Adrian Lopez)

d. Project Address: 427 Evergreen Road

Architectural Approval Application No. 3700-07 for a proposed remodel and first and second-story additions to an existing one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Ed Bredthauer, Architect)

e. Project Address: 465 Gibson Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3669-07 for a proposed demolition of an existing garage and construction on a detached garage. (Applicant: Eric Miller, Architects)

f. Project Address: 1223 Funston Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3719-07 for a proposed exterior alteration to a detached covered parking structure associated with a single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Maurice Bernier)

11. REGULAR AGENDA

a. Project Address: *322 Central Avenue

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 07-0223 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3451-05 for a proposed two-story addition to an existing two-story, single-family dwelling that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The proposed uncovered parking space would encroach into the north side-yard setback required by City code. (Applicant: Ted Larson, Architect)

T.R. Larson, architect, answered questions from the Board, and George Arroyo, participated in the discussion.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Billstrom, the Board voted 5-1, with Howe voting no, to approve the historic preservation permit based on the suggested findings and subject to the recommended conditions of approval listed in the staff report, including the requirement to utilize decomposed granite on the newly configured uncovered parking space.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Becom, the Board voted 5-1, with Howe voting no, to grant concept approval contingent upon the siding of the addition must match the original horizontal wood siding of the historic structure.

BOARDMEMBER TARMINA ARRIVED AND RESUMED AS PRESIDING CHAIR FOR THE BOARD.

b. Project Address: *115 10th Street

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 07-0224 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3673-07 to allow an addition to an existing single-family dwelling listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. The proposed standard-sized garage and its eaves would be within setback requirements. (Applicant: Bruce and Elizabeth Fryman)

Teri Takikawa, designer, presented the project and answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Howe-Hall, the Board voted 4-3, with Hinshaw, Spradling and Tarmina voting no, to approve the historic preservation permit based on

the suggested findings and subject to the recommended conditions of approval listed in the staff report and grant concept approval.

c. Project Address: *182 Laurel Avenue

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-0212 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3597-06 for a proposed remodel and additions, including a partial second-story addition, to a one-story single-family residence that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The property has less than the minimum required number of off-street covered parking spaces; two are required and there is a one-car garage on the site. The existing garage encroaches into the required 8' west side yard setback and the garage eave is less than 3' from the west property line. The project includes attaching the garage to the residence and reducing the length of the garage parking space to less than the minimum required 20'. (Applicant: Eric Miller Architects)

Eric Miller, architect, presented the project and answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Tarmina-Howe, the Board voted 7-0 to refer the application back to the applicant for further study and continue the item to the November 27, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting.

d. Project Address: 381 Laurel Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3355-05 for a proposed remodel and second-story addition to a one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Domenica Gianino)

Wisam Nader, architect, presented the project.

On a motion by Billstrom-Hall, the Board voted 6-1, with Hinshaw voting no, to grant concept approval.

The Board took a 5 minute break.

e. Project Address: 45 Beach Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3697-07 and Tree Removal Permit No. CDD 59287 for proposed exterior alterations to an existing single-family dwelling and removal of 2 olive trees. (Applicant: Steve Mickel)

Steve Mickel, designer, presented the project and answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Tarmina-Hall, the Board voted 6-1, with Howe voting no, to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval of the garage door and trim detail and to approve Tree Removal Permit No. CDD 59287 subject to the recommended replacement planting of 2 for 1 on the site. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Hall and Hinshaw

f. Project Address: 551 Gibson Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 2883-01 for review of the illumination levels of exterior lighting for the two multi-unit structures at Forest Hill Manor. This review is a mitigation measure that was adopted by the City Council when the project was initially approved. (Applicant: California Nevada Methodist Homes)

Bill Camille, project manager for Forest Hill Manor, answered questions from the board.

On a motion by Tarmina-Spradling, the Board voted 7-0 to refer the application back to the applicant for further study and continue the item to the December 11, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting.

g. Project Address: 551 Gibson Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 2883-01 for proposed exterior lighting for the four-story south wing addition, with underground parking, to Forest Hill Manor. (California Nevada Methodist Homes)

Bill Camille, project manager for Forest Hill Manor, presented the project.

On a motion by Tarmina-Becom, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval of the light fixtures. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Howe and Tarmina

h. Project Address: 403 Crocker Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3708-07 and Tree Removal Permit No. CDD 59555 for a proposed 1,056 square foot addition to an existing detached garage workshop, and removal of 1 two-stemmed oak tree. (Applicant: Susan

Bailey)

Tom Hutton, property owner, presented the project.

On a motion by Tarmina-Billstrom, the Board voted 7-0 grant concept approval and to approve Tree Removal Permit No. CDD 59555 subject to the recommended replacement planting 2 for 1 on the site and based on the standard finding for approval of a tree removal application. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of a tree removal application.

BOARDMEMBER SPRADLING STEPPED DOWN BEFORE DISCUSSION OF THE NEXT ITEM DUE TO OWNING PROPERTY WITHIN 500 FEET OF THE PROJECT.

i. Project Address: 440 Crocker Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3713-07 for a proposed addition to existing non-historic single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Dennis Hodgin)

Dennis Hodgin, architect, presented the project.

On a motion by Howe-Hall, the Board voted 6-0 to grant concept approval.

BOARDMEMEBER SPRADLING RETURNED TO HER CHAIR.

j. Project Address: 837 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3518-05 for a proposed on-site relocation of a two-story single-family dwelling listed on the PacificGrove Historic Resources Inventory. The project includes additions and exterior alterations to the dwelling, Historic Relocation Permit No. 07-60 has been approved for this project. (Applicant: Eddie Hurt, Architect)

Eddie Hurt, architect, answered questions from the Board.

Letter received:

From all objecting neighbors and prior appellants of record.

Speakers:

Rosie Edwards, 853 Sea Palm Avenue, in opposition.

Dwight Edwards, 853 Sea Palm Avenue, in opposition.

Pam Silkwood, representing the property owner, spoke to the legal scope of deliberations tonight.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Billstrom, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval of the windows and window detail. Approval is based on the standard finding of approval of an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Becom and Hinshaw

k. Project Address: 826 Balboa Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 35199-05 (Final) for proposed construction of a new two-story, single-family dwelling and a detached two-car garage. The property is located in an archeologically sensitive area. (Applicant: Eddie Hurt, Architect)

Eddie Hurt, architect, answered questions from the Board.

Letter received:

From all objecting neighbors and prior appellants of record.

Speakers:

Dwight Edwards, 853 Sea Palm Avenue, in opposition.

Rosie Edwards, 833 Sea Palm Avenue, in opposition.

Pam Silkwood, representing the property owner, spoke to the legal scope of deliberations tonight.

On a motion by Billstrom-Tarmina, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval of the stone details. Approval is based on the standard finding of approval for an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Hall and Howe

l. 625 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3717-07 for a proposed exterior change to an existing multi-story hotel. (Applicant: Allied Construction)

Robert Lym, representing Lovers Point Inn, presented the project.

On a motion by Hall-Tarmina, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

m. POSSIBLE CONSOLIDATION OF ADVISORY BODIES

The Board discussed possible options for the integration of the Historic Resources Committee.

12. REPORTS OF BOARDMEMBERS

None.

13. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:38 p.m.

**TRICIA WOTAN
SECRETARY**

*Building identified on the Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory.

STANDARD FINDING FOR APPROVAL OF AN ARCHITECTURAL APPROVAL APPLICATION

The architecture and general appearance of the building(s) will be in keeping with the neighborhood and the completed project will not be detrimental to the orderly and harmonious development of the City nor impair the desirability of investment or occupation in the neighborhood.

FINDING FOR THE APPROVAL OF TREE REMOVAL PERMIT APPLICATION

The tree(s) are in poor health which cannot be remedied by reasonable forestry practices and also, due to their location respect to with respect to topography and required setbacks, prevent reasonable development of permitted uses.

JUDICIAL TIME LIMITS

This serves as written notice that Pacific Grove Municipal Code Section 1.20.010 incorporates Section 1094.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure of the State of California and provides a ninety-day limitation for judicial review of any final administrative decision by the council, or any board, commissioner, or officer of the city.