

MINUTES OF THE PACIFIC GROVE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

SITE REVIEW

April 25, 2006
City Manager Conference Room
Pacific Grove City Hall
300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove
12:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Jeff Becom
Darlene Billstrom
Ken Hinshaw
Doug Howe, Vice Chair
Maryanne L. Spradling
Dennis Tarmina, Chair

Absent: Scott Hall

Staff: Garcia, Nelson and Rideout

1. Public Comments

None

2. Agenda Item Presentations

Staff presented the projects on the Architectural Review Board Agenda and answered questions from Boardmembers.

3. Site Review

Boardmembers Becom, Billstrom, Hinshaw, Spradling and Tarmina visited all of the following sites. Boardmember Howe visited the first six sites.

- | | |
|------------------------------------|-----------------------------|
| a. 401 Pine Avenue | f. 1015 Del Monte Boulevard |
| b. 224 5 th Street | g. 811 Walnut Street |
| c. 127 7 th Street | h. 718 Hillcrest Avenue |
| d. 125 Grand Avenue | i. 304 Prescott Lane |
| e. 137-139 18 th Street | |

4. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned in the field at 3:10 p.m.

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MEETING

April 25, 2006
City Council Chambers
300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove
4:00 p.m.

Tape: 06-08

Boardmembers Present: Jeff Becom
Darlene Billstrom
Ken Hinshaw
Doug Howe, Vice Chair
Maryanne L. Spradling
Dennis Tarmina, Chair

Absent: Scott Hall

Staff: Garcia and Rideout

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

On a motion by Howe-Billstrom, the Board voted 5-0, to approve the minutes of the April 11, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

None.

3. COMMUNICATIONS

None.

4. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

None.

5. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS

Staff reported.

6. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS

Staff reported

7. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Project Address: 125 Ocean View Boulevard, American Tin Cannery

Sign Permit Application No. 05-0995 for a proposed Master Sign Program for the American Tin Cannery. (Applicant: Foursome Development Company)

Staff reported subcommittee approval of tenant sign standards.

Subcommittee: Billstrom and Hinshaw

8. ITEMS WITHDRAWN

None

9. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE

a. Project Address: 837 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3518-05 to demolish an existing two-story, single-family residence with an attached garage, and construct a new two-story single-family residence with an attached garage. The property is located in an archaeologically sensitive area. (Applicant: Eddie Hurt, Architect)

On a motion by Billstrom-Howe, the Board voted 6-0 to continue the item to the June 13, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

10. CONSENT AGENDA

Boardmember Billstrom requested that 224 5th Street be move to the regular agenda.

Project Address: *224 5th Street

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-0201 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3560-06 to allow a one-story addition of more than 120 square feet to a one-story single-family dwelling that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory and is located on a site have fewer than the required two off-street parking spaces. (Applicant: Michael Weber, Designer)

Boardmember Hinshaw requested that 811 Walnut Street and 585 Ocean View Boulevard be moved to the regular agenda.

Project Address: 811 Walnut Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3549-06 (Final) for proposed demolition and reconstruction of a one-story single-family dwelling and construction of one-story additions to the reconstructed dwelling. (Applicant: Jerry L. Whitney)

Project Address: 585 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3536-06 for proposed exterior alterations and construction of a new trash enclosure for a multi-family apartment complex. (Applicant: Anthony Zavitsanos)

On a motion by Howe-Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the consent agenda. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

a. Project Address: 801 Spruce Avenue

Amend Architectural Approval No. 3444-05 for proposed design changes and exterior alterations for the construction of additions to a one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Terry Wilson)

b. Project Address: 125 7th Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3568-06 for exterior alterations to existing multi-family residential buildings. (Applicant: Michael Boudreau, AIA)

11. REGULAR AGENDA

a. Project Address: *224 5th Street

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-0201 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3560-06 to allow a one-story addition of more than 120 square feet to a one-story single-family dwelling that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory and is located on a site have fewer than the required two off-street parking spaces. (Applicant: Michael Weber, Designer)

Associate Planner Rideout presented the staff report.

Michael Weber, designer, presented the project, and Peter Moppert, property owner.

The Chair opened the public hearing.

There being no speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

Howe stated that the proposed batten spacing should match the existing battens.

On a motion by Billstrom-Howe, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the Historic Preservation permit and based upon the suggested findings and subject to the conditions of approval listed in the staff report and grant approval of Architectural Approval Application No. 3560-06 based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application and Appendix 1 of the Architectural Review Guidelines, Items 1 and 2, and subject to spacing the battens at 12" on center.

b. Project Address: 811 Walnut Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3549-06 (Final) for proposed demolition and reconstruction of a one-story single-family dwelling and construction of one-story additions to the reconstructed dwelling. (Applicant: Jerry L. Whitney)

Roger Wheeler, property owner, answered questions from the Board.

Hinshaw was concerned with the profiles of the proposed vinyl windows and suggested using an aluminum-clad window.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Howe, the Board voted 6-0 to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval for windows. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Hinshaw and Howe

c. Project Address: 585 Ocean View Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3536-06 for proposed exterior alterations and construction of a new trash enclosure for a multi-family apartment complex. (Applicant: Anthony Zavitsanos)

Anthony Zavitsanos, architect, answered questions from the Board.

Hinshaw stated that the proposed vinyl banisters would be appropriate if painted but was concerned with the profiles of the proposed vinyl windows.

Becom and Howe agreed, with Howe stating that the glass is flush with the frames and appears totally flat on both the windows and doors.

Becom stated that an aluminum-clad product would appear more solid.

Spradling and Billstrom suggested investigating an alternative material such as fiberglass to provide some relief to the door and window profiles.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Billstrom, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant to restudy the window and door materials and continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

d. Project Address: *139 18th Street

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-0200 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3558-06 for a proposed two-story addition to a single-family dwelling that encroaches into a required south side yard setback. The property is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Julie Guarnotta)

Associate Planner Rideout presented the staff report.

Julie Guarnotta, property owner, presented the project and answered Boardmembers' questions.

The Chair opened the public hearing.

There being no speakers, the Chair closed the public hearing.

All the Boardmembers were concerned with the proposed placement of the two-story addition with respect to the south side property line, the as-built tiles on the front porch and steps, and that the drawings did not reflect existing details of the historic residence.

Several Boardmembers were also concerned with the proportion of the two-story addition to the one-story original house and suggested lowering the second-story plate height.

Howe stated that the second-story should conform to the required setback.

Several Boardmembers also suggested off-setting the proposed addition.

On a motion by Billstrom-Howe, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant to restudy the issues raised by the Board, and continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

e. Project Address: 1015 Del Monte Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3521-05 for a proposed new two-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Brian Spector)

Brian Spector, architect, presented the project.

Hinshaw stated that, with respect to neighborhood context, it is turning into a "nouveau craftsman" style neighborhood and the proposed project generally fits in. He also stated that the finish details are bothersome.

Becom stated that the arched windows and doors are typically not found in the craftsman-style. He was also concerned with the textured siding materials and that the balcony railings are inappropriate for the overall design.

Howe agreed with the siding concern and stated that the large arched window on the front elevation is out of proportion and should be reduced in size.

Spradling, noting that the neighborhood is changing from one-story homes to two-story homes, stated her concerns of "canyonization" between homes and suggested reducing the plate height on the second-story. She also stated that the front elevation has a busy appearance.

Billstrom agreed with Spradling and also was concerned with the arched garage doors.

Tarmina was concerned with the mass of the second-story.

Several Boardmembers were concerned with the use of arched windows and the uneven sizes of all the windows.

All the Boardmembers were concerned with the proportion of the front arched window.

On a motion by Billstrom-Howe, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant to restudy the issues raised by the Board and continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

f. Project Address: 304 Prescott

Architectural Approval Application No. 3552-06 and Tree Permit Application No. CDD 58260 for a proposed remodel and additions, including a partial second-story addition, to a one-story single-family dwelling. The project includes removal of 1 oak tree. (Applicant: Ramona Lowe)

Ramona Lowe, designer, presented the project and Bill Karaki, property owner participated in the discussion.

Billstrom was concerned with the accuracy of the rear elevation drawings with respect to existing grade.

Several Boardmembers were concerned with the scale of the balconies and the mass of the building toward the rear.

Becom was concerned that the stucco siding is out of character in the neighborhood.

Hinshaw suggested that a combination of wood siding and stucco may soften the appearance of the rear elevation.

Howe disagreed, noting that the proposed second-story is well away from the rear property line. He noted concerns with the roof shapes at the front entry.

Tarmina suggested staggering the proportions of the balconies to break up the mass.

On a motion Hinshaw-Tarmina, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant for further study of the issues raised during discussion, and continue the item to the May 9, 2006, Architectural Review Board meeting.

g. Project Address: *137 18th Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3566-06 for proposed exterior alterations and addition of a dormer to a single-family dwelling that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Margaret Healy)

Margaret Healy, property owner, presented the project.

All the Boardmembers were concerned with the proportion and scale of the dormer and the arched window.

Several Boardmembers suggested investigating, reduced dormer sizes with different roof shapes and locations.

On a motion by Billstrom-Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant for further study and continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

h. Project Address: *125 Grand Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3565-06 for proposed exterior alterations to a single-family dwelling that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Kevin Downey)

Zenna Corbett, representing the property owner, presented the application.

Billstrom was concerned with the sliding glass door.

On a motion by Billstrom-Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to grant final approval subject to the applicant installing a twelve light out-swing door. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

i. Project Address: 718 Hillcrest Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3564-06 for proposed exterior alterations and one-story additions to a one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: DMC Construction)

Michael Mosebach, representing DMC, presented the project, and Lisa Chiantelli, property owner, participated in the discussion.

Billstrom stated that the columns and archways and arched garage doors are inappropriate with the style of the house and that the new front window configuration should mimic the existing bay window.

Spradling was concerned that the new windows are not unified with the existing windows.

Howe stated that the row of columns provides a rhythmic appearance but the columns are out of proportion with the porch overhang. He was also concerned with the expansive roof shape and the proportions of the arched garage doors and suggested leaving a space between the tops of the doors and the plate.

Becom stated that he appreciates the symmetry of the front elevation, but was concerned with the overall design.

Hinshaw was also concerned with the front window.

On a motion by Howe-Hinshaw, the Board voted 5-1, with Tarmina voting no, referred that application back to the applicant to restudy the issues raised during discussion, and to continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

BOARDMEMBER HINSHAW LEFT THE MEETING.

j. Project Address: 401 Pine Avenue

Sign Permit Application No. 06-1020 for a proposed replacement of an existing monument sign. (Applicant: Community Missionary Baptist Church (Deacon Ulysses Taylor))

Reverend Kenny Murray, and Reverend Tim Kirkland, representing Community Missionary Baptist Church, presented the sign application.

All of the Boardmembers were concerned with the commercial appearance, materials, size, lighting and proposed placement of the sign.

On a motion by Tarmina-Spradling, the Board voted 5-0 to refer the application back to the applicant for further study and continue the item to the May 9, 2006 Architectural Review Board meeting.

12. REPORTS OF BOARDMEMBERS

None

13. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 7:10 p.m.

**SALLY RIDEOUT
ACTING SECRETARY**

*Building identified on the Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory.

STANDARD FINDING FOR APPROVAL OF AN ARCHITECTURAL APPROVAL APPLICATION

The architecture and general appearance of the building(s) will be in keeping with the neighborhood and the completed project will not be detrimental to the orderly and harmonious development of the City nor impair the desirability of investment or occupation in the neighborhood.

CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMITTEE

SITE REVIEW MEETING MINUTES

April 17, 2006

12:00 p.m.

Community Development Department Conference Room

Pacific Grove City Hall

Committee Members Present: Darlene Billstrom , Ken Hinshaw, Fran Horvath

Committee Members Absent: Pete Houser, Michael Puckett, Rebecca Riddell

Vacancy: One

Staff: Barbara Nelson, Senior Planner

There was no quorum for the site review meeting. The members present visited the following sites that are the subjects of regular agenda items scheduled for public hearing at today's meeting.

- 837 Ocean View Boulevard
- 182 Laurel Avenue

CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMITTEE

MINUTES

April 17, 2006

Tape #06-02

4:00 p.m.

Council Chambers, Pacific Grove City Hall

1. ROLL CALL

Present: Darlene Billstrom, Ken Hinshaw, Fran Horvath, Pete Houser,
Michael Puckett, Rebecca Riddell

Absent: None

Vacancies: One

Staff: Barbara Nelson, Senior Planner

Chairperson Darlene Billstrom welcomed Fran Horvath as the new member to the
Historic Resources Committee.

2. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

On a motion by Pete Houser-Ken Hinshaw the Committee voted 6-0 to approve
the minutes of the March 8, 2006 site review and regular meetings.

3. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

None

4. ITEMS TO BE CONTINUED OR WITHDRAWN

None.

5. CONSENT AGENDA

None.

6. REGULAR AGENDA

**6.A A PUBLIC HEARING TO DETERMINE WHETHER TO INITIATE
THE PROCESS AND TO DETERMINE WHETHER THE PROPERTY
AT 837 OCEAN VIEW BOULEVARD SHOULD BE ADDED TO THE
CITY'S HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY (Staff: Barbara Nelson)**

Senior Planner Barbara Nelson summarized the agenda packet materials for this item.

Chairperson Darlene Billstrom opened the public hearing.

Eddie Hurt, Architect, represented the property owners, Gerald and Judith Butler, informed Committee members that the owners are opposed to adding the property to the historic resources inventory. Mr. Hurt provided background regarding the history of the current project and reviewed the alterations and additions to the residence that have occurred over the years. Mr. Hurt noted that there is no evidence that the property meets any of the evaluation criteria required by the City's ordinance to add a property to the historic resources inventory. Mr. Hurt commented that the residence is not a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style and noted that the architect that currently serves on the City's Architectural Review Board also commented that the residence is not a good example of the Spanish Eclectic style.

Rosie Edwards, asked a general question regarding the age of historic resources.

There being no other speakers the public hearing was closed.

Committee members made the following comments during deliberation.

Ken Hinshaw – Most of the front elevation is intact. Supports adding the property to the historic resources inventory.

Rebecca Riddell – Agrees with Ken Hinshaw. Supports adding the property to the historic resources inventory and commented that her family has always considered the property to be a landmark location. Noted that the historic resources inventory is not date specific.

Pete Houser – Does not support adding the property to the historic resources inventory because there is no evidence that supports designating this property as historic.

Michael Puckett – There is no evidence to support adding this property to the historic resources inventory. The residence has been significantly altered and the original exterior characteristics are not known. Does not support adding the property to the historic resources inventory based on speculation.

Fran Horvath – The property has not been well maintained. There is a lack of information regarding the footprint and exterior characteristics of the original residence.

Darlene Billstrom – The residence has been in its present location since 1930 and is an established visual feature. Although it is not an exemplary example of the Spanish Eclectic style there are not many examples of this style in the city. The additions to the residence can be removed and the residence can be rehabilitated. Supports adding the property to the historic resources inventory.

On a motion by Ken Hinshaw-Rebecca Riddell, **the Committee voted 4-2 (Pete Houser, Michael Puckett) to initiate the process to add the property to the Historic Resources Inventory.**

On a motion by Ken Hinshaw-Fran Horvath, **the Committee voted 4-2 (Pete Houser, Michael Puckett) to add the property to the Historic Resources Inventory** finding that the residence on the subject property meets the following evaluation criteria:

1. The property has a unique location and physical characteristics that represent an established and familiar visual feature in the neighborhood, community, and the City of Pacific Grove (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (h)); and,
2. The subject residence retains the integrity of the original design (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (i)); and,
3. The property contributes to the architectural aesthetics and continuity of the street (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (j)).

6.B A PUBLIC HEARING TO DETERMINE WHETHER TO INITIATE THE PROCESS AND TO DETERMINE WHETHER THE PROPERTY AT 182 LAUREL AVENUE SHOULD BE ADDED TO THE CITY'S HISTORIC RESOURCES INVENTORY (Staff: Barbara Nelson)

Senior Planner Barbara Nelson summarized the agenda packet materials for this item.

Chairperson Darlene Billstrom opened the public hearing.

There were no speakers, the public hearing was closed.

Committee members made the following comments during deliberation.

Michael Puckett – The property should be added to the historic resources inventory.

Pete Houser – No comments.

Rebecca Riddell – The residence meets the evaluation criteria for addition. The residence represents the Craftsman style.

Ken Hinshaw – The property meets evaluation criteria (d), (i), and (j). The residence has retained its original integrity and contributes to the aesthetic of the street.

Fran Horvath – Agrees with comments made by Ken Hinshaw.

Darlene Billstrom – Agrees with comments made by Ken Hinshaw.

On a motion by Michael Puckett-Ken Hinshaw, **the Committee voted 6-0 to initiate the process to add the property to the Historic Resources Inventory.**

On a motion by Michael Puckett-Rebecca Riddell, **the Committee voted 6-0 to add the property to the Historic Resources Inventory** finding

1. The residence is a good example of the California Bungalow style (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (d)); and,
2. The subject residence retains the integrity of the original design (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (i)); and,
3. The property contributes to the architectural aesthetics and continuity of the street (Municipal Code Section 23.76.025 (j)).

6.C RECEIVE AND DISCUSS HISTORIC PRESERVATION ORDINANCE REVISION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT (Darlene Billstrom)

Darlene Billstrom reported regarding the status of draft ordinance revisions that will be presented to the Committee at a later date.

6.D RECEIVE AND DISCUSS HISTORIC PRESERVATION PUBLIC INFORMATION SUBCOMMITTEE REPORT (Billstrom)

Michael Puckett reported regarding on-going efforts to contact professionals in the real estate industry.

7. REPORTS OF OTHER COMMITTEES

None

8. REPORTS OF COMMITTEE MEMBERS

Rebecca Riddell reported regarding an upcoming AMAP event on the economics of historic preservation. The event is scheduled for May 19th, additional information will be distributed as it becomes available.

9. REPORTS FROM STAFF

None

10. AGENDA FORECAST

- **ELECTION OF OFFICERS**
- **SUBCOMMITTEE APPOINTMENTS (BILLSTROM)**
- **DISCUSSION OF EVALUATION CRITERIA (HOUSER)**
- **SECRETARY OF THE INTERIOR'S STANDARDS FOR REHABILITATION TRAINING (NELSON)**

11. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 5:25 p.m.

BARBARA NELSON
Secretary