

CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
PLANNING COMMISSION

SITE REVIEW MINUTES

May 2, 2006

4:00 p.m.

Community Development Department Conference Room

Commissioners Present: Linda Bailey, Bob Davis, Steven MacDonald, Craig Riddell,
Gary Sprader

Commissioners Absent: Dan Miller, Eric Miller

Vacancies: None

Staff: Jon Biggs, Sally Rideout

Staff presented the following projects:

905 Ocean View Blvd. APPLICANT: Eric Miller Architects
PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposed first and second-story additions to a single-family dwelling and detached garage that have nonconforming setbacks and fewer off-street parking spaces than required. The proposed project includes first floor additions that encroach into required setbacks. (Staff: Sally Rideout)

1143 Presidio Blvd. APPLICANT: Samuel E. Buttrey, owner
PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposed removal of two Monterey Pine trees.
(Staff: Sally Rideout)

Dena Ibrahim, on behalf of the adjacent property owners, commented on proposed tree removal.

The following sites were visited by the named Commissioners (staff in attendance are noted in parentheses).

1143 Presidio Blvd: Bailey, Davis, MacDonald, Riddell, Sprader (Biggs, Rideout)

There being no further business, the Commissioners adjourned at 4:55 p.m. at the site.

Jon Biggs, Secretary

CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE
PLANNING COMMISSION

MINUTES

May 4, 2006
Tape 06-09
6:00 p.m.
Council Chambers, Pacific Grove City Hall

1. **ROLL CALL**

Roll Call

Present: Linda Bailey, Bob Davis (Chair), Steven MacDonald,
Craig Riddell, Gary Sprader

Absent: Dan Miller, Eric Miller

Vacancy: None

Staff: Jon Biggs, Sally Rideout

2. **MINUTES**

On a motion by Craig Riddell-Steven MacDonald, the Commission voted 5-0 to **approve the following minutes:**

Minutes
Approved

- Minutes of the site review meeting of April 18, 2006;
- Minutes of the regular meeting of April 20, 2006.

3. **COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC**

David Dilworth spoke concerning recent removal of trees within the city limits.

Public
Comment

4. **REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE OR WITHDRAWAL**

On a motion by Linda Bailey-Craig Riddell, the Commission voted 5-0 to **continue item 6.C to the regular meeting of May 18, 2006.**

Continuances/
Withdrawals

6.C A public hearing to consider (1) Proposed Mitigated Negative Declaration and Mitigation Monitoring Program; (2) Use Permit Application No. 2884-05

PROJECT ADDRESS: 802 Mermaid Avenue

APPLICANT: Joseph Rock, Architect

PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposed demolition of an existing nonconforming duplex and reconstruction of a single-family dwelling on a substandard-sized building site that is located in an archaeologically sensitive area. (Staff: Sally Rideout)

REASON FOR CONTINUANCE: Requested by applicant to allow time for submission of additional design changes.

Proposed
Mit. Neg. Dec.
& Monitoring;
UP 2884-05;
Continued to
5/18/06

5. CONSENT AGENDA

None.

**Consent
Agenda**

6. REGULAR AGENDA

- 6.A** A continued public hearing to consider Use Permit Application No. 2890-05 and Variance Application No. 05-1688
PROJECT ADDRESS: **905 Ocean View Boulevard**
APPLICANT: Eric Miller Architects
PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposed first and second-story additions to a single-family dwelling and detached garage that have nonconforming setbacks and fewer off-street parking spaces than required. The proposed project includes first floor additions that encroach into required setbacks. (Staff: Sally Rideout) [Continued from 4/20/06]

**UP 2890-05;
Variance
05-1688
approved**

Associate Planner Rideout presented the staff report.

The Chairman opened the public hearing.

Correspondence Received Since 4/20/06 Hearing:

- E-mail dated 5/2/06 from Mary and Bill Fredrickson in opposition.
- Memorandum dated 5/4/06 from staff (Sally Rideout) in response to questions and concerns raised at the May 2, 2006 site review meeting.

Speakers:

- Mark Ellis, Project Manager, on behalf of Eric Miller Architects, spoke concerning the project.

There being no further speakers, the Chairman closed the public hearing.

The Commissioners discussed the project and particularly focused on the chimney. The applicant agreed to modify the projection of the chimney so that it was no closer to the property line than the existing chimney.

On a motion by Craig Riddell-Steven MacDonald, the Commission voted 5-0 to **approve Use Permit No. 2890-05 and Variance No. 05-1688** based on the findings and subject to the terms and conditions contained in the staff report prepared for the meeting of May 4, 2006, with the exception of variance finding number 2 which is revised to read as follows:

2. Granting the variance is necessary for the preservation and enjoyment of substantial property rights of the applicant because it enables the property owner to improve the property in a manner consistent with other residential uses in the immediate vicinity of the site. Chimneys are a typical architectural feature of single-family dwellings in the immediate vicinity of the site, and granting this variance allows the property owner to improve their property in a manner consistent with other residential uses in the immediate vicinity of the site.

- 6.B** A public hearing to consider Tree Removal Permit Application No. CDD 58261
PROJECT ADDRESS: **1143 Presidio Boulevard**
APPLICANT: Samuel E. Buttrey, owner
PROJECT DESCRIPTION: Proposed removal of two Monterey Pine trees. (Staff: Sally Rideout)

**Tree Removal
Permit No.
CDD 58261
Continued to
6/8/06**

Associate Planner Rideout presented the staff report.

The Chairman opened the public hearing.

Correspondence Received:

- E-mail dated 4/12/06 from Public Works Director Steve Leiker to Arborist Robert Reid concerning assessment of trees at 1143 Presidio Blvd.
- Letter dated 4/6/06 from Arborist Frank Ono to the homeowners, Sam Buttrey and Elinda Hardy, in support of removal of the trees.
- Letter dated 1/4/06 from Arborist Frank Ono to the homeowners, Sam Buttrey and Elinda Hardy, in support of removal of the trees in the front yard.
- Fax received 4/19/06 from neighbor Dena Ibrahim in opposition to the tree removal.

Speakers:

- Samuel Buttrey and Elinda Hardy, owners, gave information concerning the proposed tree removal and their reasons for the request.
- Dina Ibrahim expressed her concerns with the proposal and the process.
- Madeline Michael expressed concern about additional trees being removed within the city limits.
- Halil Ibrahim spoke in opposition to the proposed tree removal.
- David Dilworth spoke in opposition.

Chairman Davis invited rebuttal to the opponents comments.

- Owner, Samuel Buttrey, responded to allegations concerning tree trimming in the past, and asked David Dilworth if he had any evidence that the tree was healthy.
- Surrebuttal by Mr. Dilworth.

Staff requested copies of photos presented at the meeting by Mr. Dilworth in electronic format.

There being no further speakers, the Chairman closed the public hearing.

A motion to continue item 6.B to the next regular meeting to allow the parties the opportunity to work together to obtain a third arborist/forester opinion on the condition of the tree failed.

A second motion to approve the tree removal permit subject to the terms and conditions contained in the staff report was withdrawn prior to a vote.

On a motion by Craig Riddell-Gary Sprader, the Commission voted 5-0 to **continue item 6.B to the regular meeting of June 8, 2006**, to allow the parties an opportunity to present their respective opinions before a full commission and encouraged the parties to work together to obtain an additional opinion concerning the condition of the tree from a third arborist/forester.

7. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS

- Director Biggs reported .

City
Council

8. ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD ACTIONS

- Received the Minutes of the April 25, 2006 site review meeting of the Architectural Review Board.
- Received the Minutes of the April 25, 2006 regular meeting of the Architectural Review Board.

ARB

9. HISTORIC RESOURCES COMMITTEE ACTIONS

- Received the Minutes of the April 17, 2006 special site review meeting of the Historic Resources Committee.
- Received the Minutes of the April 17, 2006 special meeting of the Historic Resources Committee.

HRC

10. CORRESPONDENCE

None.

**Corres-
pondence**

11. COMMITTEE REPORTS

Subcommittee members gave a brief update on the status of their committee work.

**Committee
Reports**

12. REPORTS OF COMMISSIONERS

Commissioners reported.

**Commissioner
Reports**

13. REPORT OF COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DIRECTOR

Director Biggs reported.

**Director's
Report**

14. ADJOURNMENT:

There being no further business, the Chair adjourned the meeting at 9:05 p.m.

Jon M. Biggs, Secretary