

MINUTES OF THE PACIFIC GROVE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

SITE REVIEW

May 22, 2007

City Manager Conference Room

Pacific Grove City Hall

300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove

12:00 PM

Boardmembers Present: Jeff Becom
Darlene Billstrom
Scott Hall
Doug Howe
Ken Hinshaw
Maryanne L. Spradling
Dennis Tarmina, Chair

Staff: Biggs, Garcia, and Wotan

1. Public Comments

None

2. Agenda Item Presentations

Staff presented the projects on the Architectural Review Board Agenda and answered questions from Boardmembers.

3. Site Review

Boardmembers present visited:

165 Acacia Avenue

512 9th Street, with Boardmember Howe stepping down.

315 Crocker Avenue

Turn out area at ocean View Boulevard between Acropolis and Asilomar Avenues

4. Adjournment

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned in the field at 2:20 p.m.

MINUTES OF THE ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD MEETING

May 22, 2007

City Council Chambers

300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove

4:00 p.m.

Tape: 07-10

Boardmembers Present: Jeff Becom
Darlene Billstrom
Scott Hall
Ken Hinshaw
Doug Howe, Vice Chair
Maryanne L. Spradling
Dennis Tarmina, Chair

Staff: Garcia and Wotan

1. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

On a motion by Howe-Billstrom, the Board voted 5-0-2, with Spradling and Tarmina abstaining from voting, to approve the minutes of the May 8, 2007, Architectural Review Board meeting.

2. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

None.

3. COMMUNICATIONS

Staff reported on the newly adopted City Council Policy Governing, Council, Board, Commission and Committee Member Appearances at City hearings and Meetings and distributed copies of the policy to Board Members.

4. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

A letter received from Michael Kelly, 1130 Crest Avenue concerning future golf course netting.

5. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS

Staff reported.

6. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS

Staff reported.

7. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

None.

8. ITEMS WITHDRAWN

None.

9. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE

Project Address: *419 Congress Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3645-07 for a proposed second-story addition and remodel to an existing single-family dwelling that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: David Prew)

Project Address: 182 Laurel Avenue

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-0212 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3597-06 for a proposed remodel and additions, including a partial second-story addition, to a one-story single-family residence that is included on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. The property has less than the minimum required number of off-street covered parking spaces; two are required and there is a one-car garage on the site. The existing garage encroaches into the required 8' west side yard setback and the garage eave is less than 3' from the west property line. The project includes attaching the garage to the residence and reducing the length of the garage parking space to less than the minimum required 20'. (Applicant: Eric Miller Architects)

Project Address: *157 Pacific Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3652-07 for proposed exterior alterations to an existing single-family dwelling that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Enrique Eckhaus)

Project Address: 604 Spruce Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3657-07 for proposed exterior modifications to an existing single-family dwelling that is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Lori & Mike Schimpf)

On a motion by Hall-Howe, the Board voted 7-0 to continue 419 Congress Avenue to the June 12, 2007 Architectural Review Board meeting.

10. CONSENT AGENDA

Boardmember Becom requested that 541 Evergreen Road be moved to the regular agenda.

Project Address: Project Address: 541 Evergreen Road

Architectural Approval Application No. 3611-05 (Final) for proposed demolition and construction of a new two-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Geoff Welch)

On a motion by Billstrom-Howe, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval for 254 Grove Acre Avenue and 1058 Ripple Avenue. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

a. Project Address: *254 Grove Acre Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3660-07 for a proposed roofing material change to a single-family dwelling that is on the City's Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Michael Lambert)

b. Project Address: 1058 Ripple Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3648-07 (Final) for a proposed remodel and one-story addition to an existing one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Alan Turpen/Associates)

11. REGULAR AGENDA

a. Project Address: Project Address: 541 Evergreen Road

Architectural Approval Application No. 3611-05 (Final) for proposed demolition and construction of a new two-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Geoff Welch)

Geoff Welch, property owner, answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Howe, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

b. Project Address: *507 Grand Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3637-07 for a proposed conversion of an attached single-car garage into habitable space for a dwelling on the Historic Resources Inventory. (Applicant: Jill Kleiss)

Jill Kleiss, property owner, answered questions from the Board.

On a motion by Hinshaw-Hall, the Board voted 7-0 to grant final approval subject to subcommittee approval of the chimney materials. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

Subcommittee: Hinshaw and Tarmina

c. Project Address: *122 9th Street

Historic Preservation Permit Application No. 06-210 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3624-06 to allow additions and exterior alterations to a two-story nonconforming duplex listed on the Historic Resources Inventory. The project replaces an existing carport with an attached two-car garage and proposes additions, including a partial second story at the rear of the building and second story deck at the front of the building, that encroach into required setbacks. The floor area on the site is being increased for the proposed garage, which provides off-street parking. (Applicant: Charles and Kathleen Huff)

Charles Huff, property owner, answered questions from the Board.

Bill Clements, 117 8th Street, spoke in support of the project.

On a motion by Billstrom-Spradling, the Board voted 7-0 to refer the application back to the applicant to restudy the roofline, stairway and elevator and continue the item to the June 12, 2007 Architectural Review Board meeting.

d. Project Address: 1152 Patterson Lane

Architectural Approval Application No. 3656-07 for a proposed remodel and second-story addition to an existing one-story single-family dwelling. (Applicant: Eddie Hurt, Architect)

Eddie Hurt, architect, answered questions from the Board. David Osorio, property owner, participated in the discussion.

On a motion by Hall-Howe, the Board voted 4-3, with Becom, Hinshaw and Tarmina voting no, to grant concept approval.

BOARDMEMBER HINSHAW STEPPED DOWN BEFORE DISCUSSION OF THE NEXT ITEM DUE TO OWNING PROPERTY WITHIN 500 FEET OF THE PROJECT.

e. Project Address: 310 Granite Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3620-06 (Final) for a proposed two-story single-family dwelling with an attached garage. (Applicant: William David Martin, AIA, and Associates)

William David Martin, architect, answered questions from the Board.

Letter received:

Tom and Lori Rolander, 302 Granite Street, in support of the project.

Speakers:

Peg Wittrock, 229 Locust Street, spoke in support.

David Wittrock, 229 Locust Street, spoke in support.

Jean Thompson, 315 Granite Street, spoke in support.

Ann Pettit, 310 Granite Street, spoke in support.

Brian George, 238 Wood Street, spoke in support.

Mr. Leslie, 520 Lobos Avenue, spoke in support.

Rick Pettit, 310 Granite Street, spoke in support.

Larry Jones, 311 Willow Street, spoke in opposition.

On a motion by Tarmina-Hall, the Board voted 5-1, with Spradling voting no, to grant final approval. Approval is based on the standard finding for approval of an architectural approval application.

BOARDMEMBER HINSHAW RETURNED TO HIS SEAT.

f. Project Address: 165 Acacia Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3653-07 and Tree Trimming Permit No. CDD 59258 for proposed new two-story single-family dwelling and trimming of trees. (Applicant: Michael Martin Engineering)

David Prew, designer, presented the project.

On a motion by Tarmina-Hinshaw, the Board voted 7-0 to refer the application back to the applicant and continue the item to the June 26, 2007 Architectural Review Board meeting.

BOARDMEMBER HOWE STEPPED DOWN BEFORE DISCUSSION OF THE NEXT TWO ITEMS DUE TO OWNING PROPERTY WITHIN 500 FEET OF THE PROJECTS.

h. Project Address: 512 9th Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3632-07 for proposed remodel and additions to an existing single-family dwelling in an R-1 zone district. (Applicant: Gerry Alston for Bob Morris)

Darren Davis, designer, presented the project.

Speakers:

Ruth Kleese, 508 9th Street, spoke in opposition.

Simon Tuffs, 381 Junipero Avenue, spoke in opposition.

Mitsy Dallas, 509 10th Street, spoke in opposition.

Kathleen, 509 10th Street, spoke in opposition.

Ms. Slivera, 509 10th Street, spoke in opposition.

Jerry Alston, 512 9th Street, property owner, spoke in support.

Steve Dallas, 509 10th Street, spoke in opposition.

Chuck Kolby, contractor, spoke in support.

On a motion by Billstrom-Hall, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the application back to the applicant and continue the item to the June 12, 2007

i. Project Address: 373 Junipero Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3586-06 and Tree Removal Permit Application No. CDD 58615 for a proposed new two-story single-family dwelling in an R-1 zone district and removal of two oak trees. (Applicant: James D. McCord, architect)

James D. McCord, architect, answered questions from the Board.

Speaker:

Simon Tuffs, 381 Junipero Avenue, spoke in opposition.

On a motion by Billstrom-Spradling, the Board voted 4-2, with Hinshaw and Tarmina voting no, to deny the application.

BOARDMEMBER HOWE RETURNED TO HIS SEAT.

j. Project Address: 315 Crocker Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3640-07 and Tree Removal Permit No. CDD 59249 for a proposed new two-story single-family dwelling and removal of 14 pine trees. (Applicant: Paul Davis Partnership)

Paul Davis, architect, presented the project.

Letters received:

Nancy McDowell, 386 B Pico Place, in opposition.

Jeff Odell, 309 A Crocker Avenue, in opposition.

Speakers:

Jeff Odell, 309 A Crocker Avenue, in opposition.

Anna Mercer, 311 Crocker Avenue, in support.

On a motion by Tarmina-Howe, the Board voted 5-2, with Billstrom and Spradling voting no, to grant concept approval and noted that the tree removal permit would not be activated until a building permit was issued by the Building Department. This will be a condition applied to any approval granted to a tree removal permit application.

k. Project Address: Turn out area at Ocean View Boulevard between Acropolis and Asilomar Avenues

Architectural Approval Application No. 3662-07 for a proposed plaque, mounted on a rock, to commemorate John Denver. (Applicant: City Pacific Grove on behalf of the California Friends of John Denver)

John Miller, Recreation Director, presented the proposal.

Speakers:

Peter Aline, 1273 Ocean View Boulevard, spoke in opposition.

Tom Harris, 1275 Ocean View Boulevard, spoke in opposition.

On a motion by Hall-Billstrom, the Board voted 7-0 to refer that application back to the applicant to allow a location and materials for the plaque to be identified, and continue the item to the June 12, 2007 Architectural Review Board meeting.

12. REPORTS OF BOARDMEMBERS

None.

13. ADJOURNMENT

There being no further business, the meeting was adjourned at 8:20 p.m.

JON BIGGS

SECRETARY

*Building identified on the Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory.

STANDARD FINDING FOR APPROVAL OF AN ARCHITECTURAL APPROVAL APPLICATION

The architecture and general appearance of the building(s) will be in keeping with the neighborhood and the completed project will not be detrimental to the orderly and harmonious development of the City nor impair the desirability of investment or occupation in the neighborhood.

JUDICIAL TIME LIMITS

This serves as written notice that Pacific Grove Municipal Code Section 1.20.010 incorporates Section 1094.6 of the Code of Civil Procedure of the State of California and provides a ninety-day limitation for judicial review of any final administrative decision by the council, or any board, commissioner, or officer of the city.