



## CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE

300 FOREST AVENUE  
PACIFIC GROVE, CALIFORNIA 93950  
TELEPHONE (831) 648-3190 • FAX (831) 648-3184

### MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING

#### ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

DATE & TIME: TUESDAY, DECEMBER 8, 2009 – 6:00 P.M.

LOCATION: CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS – 300 FOREST AVENUE

**1. CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 6:03 p.m.

**2. ROLL CALL**

Architectural Review Board (ARB) Members present:

Robin Aeschliman

Jeff Becom

Jeff Edmonds, Vice-Chair

Ken Hinshaw

Doug Howe, Chair

Wilda Northrop

**3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the minutes from the November 24, 2009 ARB Site Review and Regular Meetings.**

**4. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC**

None

**5. COMMUNICATIONS**

None

**6. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE**

None

**7. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS**

None

**8. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS**

None

**9. SUBCOMMITTEE MEMBER REPORTS**

Associate Planner, Valerie Tallerico, reported that 1110 Austin is pending subcommittee review. Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn, reported that 141 Caledonia received subcommittee approval.

**10. ADMINISTRATIVE ARCHITECTURAL APPROVALS**

None

**11. ITEMS WITHDRAWN OR TABLED**

None

**12. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE****a. Project Address: 143 18<sup>th</sup> Street**

Historic Preservation Permit No. 09-0249 and Architectural Approval Application No. 3903-09 (Concept) to allow a 369 sq. ft. second-story addition to an existing single-family dwelling. The existing structure is listed on the City's Historic Resources Inventory and has non-conforming setbacks and parking.

Applicant: Ted Larson, Architect on behalf of James and Karen Withrow

CEQA status: Class 31 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP

Recommended action: **Continue to the January 12, 2010 ARB meeting.**

Staff requested that Agenda Item 13c be continued to the January 12, 2010 ARB meeting in order to resolve questions about the existing deck.

**b. Project Address: 221/223 Second Street**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3920-09 (Final), to allow the expansion of an existing deck.

Applicant: Bill Mefford, on behalf of Erica Gamecho

CEQA Status: Categorically Exempt, Class 1

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 7, 36, 37, and 38.

Staff reference: Associate Planner, Valerie Tallerico

Recommended action: **Continue to the January 12, 2010 ARB meeting.**

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to continue the projects to the January 12, 2010 ARB meeting.**

**13. CONSENT AGENDA**

**a. Project Address: 16 Beach Street**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3923-09 (Final) for a Design Change to a previously approved project, including changes to proposed exterior materials, new garden wall, and new decorative railing above garage door.

Applicant: Paul Menghetti, on behalf of Pete and Kathy Menghetti

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 36, 37 and 38

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP

Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action.

**b. Project Address: 874 Gibson Avenue**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3922-09 (Final) for a Design Change to a previously approved project, including changes to the exterior fireplace, bathroom window and stone planter.

Applicant: Joseph Rock, on behalf of Ben and Marilyn Higbie

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 36, 37 and 38

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP

Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action.

**On a motion by Edmonds, seconded by Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the Consent Agenda.**

**14. REGULAR AGENDA**

**a. Project Address: 672 Mermaid Avenue/671 Ocean View Boulevard (HRI)**

Historic Preservation Permit No. 07-0229 to allow the existing second dwelling structure on site to remain in its historic location encroaching in the east side yard setback, and replacement of a previously demolished 494 square foot detached garage with a new 808 square feet, detached three car garage that would encroach in the west side yard setback to the property line, and to retain the nonconforming parking with three covered and one uncovered parking space in lieu of the required three covered and three uncovered spaces. Architectural Approval No. 3739-07 is for the new garage design, replacement of asphalt driveway, parking pad and walkway, remodel of the existing two-story secondary housing unit known as 672 Mermaid Avenue, demolition of an attached 166 sq. ft. laundry/storage facility, and, after the fact, the new foundation under the main house at 671 Ocean View Boulevard.

Applicant: Jeanne Byrne, on behalf of the Bonnici Family

CEQA status: Mitigated Negative Declaration Prepared

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 4, 9, 10, 12, 16, 24, 27, 33, 35, 37, 38, Guidelines for Historic Buildings 1, 3, 4 & 5, and Window Guidelines 1 & 2

Staff reference: Sarah Hardgrave, Senior Planner

Recommended action: Adopt Mitigated Negative Declaration and approve Historic Preservation Permit No. 07-0229 with a project modification to reduce proposed garage from three bays to two bays, and provision of an uncovered parking space in the west side yard setback, or a modified project with a three car garage structure in the same building configuration and general footprint as the historic garages shown on the Sanborn map. Discuss and take appropriate action on the Architectural Approval.

Senior Planner Sarah Hardgrave introduced the project and reviewed the Mitigated Negative Declaration and the findings necessary for the Historic Preservation Permit and responded to questions from the Board.

Applicant, Jeanne Byrne, described the project and project history and responded to questions from the Board.

John Bridges, attorney, spoke on behalf of the owner Cathy Bonnici and described the merits of the project.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

**On a motion by Becom, seconded by Hinshaw, the Board voted 6-0 to adopt the Mitigated Negative Declaration subject to the recommended findings and conditions.**

The Board discussed the Historic Preservation Permit.

**On a motion by Hinshaw, seconded by Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the Historic Preservation Permit because, given the multiple exceptions required for this property in any design alternative and the existing conditions for other properties on Mermaid Avenue, providing covered parking is more important on this site than preserving a side yard setback. The proposed three-car detached garage with open space adjacent to 672 Mermaid is necessary for the restoration of the historic resource.**

The Board discussed the Architectural Approval Application.

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Edmonds, the Board voted 6-0 to grant Concept Architectural Approval, with the condition that the parking bay closest to the property line be setback to provide an additional uncovered off-street parking space.**

**b. Project Address: 157 Pacific Avenue (HRI)**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3857-09 for final approval of materials for renovations to a single family residence listed on the Historic Resources Inventory.

Applicant: Ted Larson, on behalf of Mr. and Mrs. Peter Ferbrache

CEQA status: Class 31 Categorical Exemption

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 33, 35, 36, and 37.

Staff reference: Associate Planner, Valerie Tallerico

Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Associate Planner, Valerie Tallerico, introduced the project.

Applicant, Ted Larson, presented the project and responded to questions from the Board.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

**On a motion by Hinshaw, seconded by Aeschliman, the Board voted 6-0 to grant Final Architectural Approval, pursuant to Architectural Review Guideline No. 1, and subject to subcommittee approval of an alternative design to support the shed roof on the front elevation (left side), a beam or post or some combination of the two may be used.**

Subcommittee members: Doug Howe and Jeff Becom.

**c. Project Address: 460 Beaumont Avenue**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3919-09 (Final), to allow the replacement of windows in a single-family dwelling.

Applicant: Jim Muncie, on behalf of Betty Shammass

CEQA Status: Categorically Exempt, Class 1

Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 37 and 38, and Window Guideline No. 3

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP

Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn, introduced the project.

Applicant, Jim Muncie, presented the project and responded to questions from the Board.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Northrop, the Board voted 6-0 to grant Final Architectural Approval, with the condition that the aluminum windows in the addition of the residence will also be replaced with vinyl windows.**

**d. Project Address: 420 Willow Street**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3912-09 to allow a remodel and addition to an existing single family dwelling and the addition of a second floor deck and exterior stairs on the rear of the residence.

Applicant: Hunter Eldridge, on behalf of Judy Brown  
CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption  
Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 7, 28, and 36  
Staff reference: Associate Planner, Valerie Tallerico  
Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action

Associate Planner Valerie Tallerico introduced the project.

Applicant Hunter Eldridge presented the project and responded to questions from the Board.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Northrop, the Board voted 6-0 to continue the project to the January 12, 2010 ARB meeting in order for the applicant to restudy the proportions of the bay window, the design of the deck and its relationship to the existing structure, consider expanding the gable roof to the rear, and consider alternative stair designs.**

**BOARD MEMBER AESCHLIMAN STEPPED DOWN PRIOR TO THE NEXT ITEM DUE TO PROXIMITY OF HER HOME TO THE PROPOSED PROJECT.**

**e. Project Address: 883 Lighthouse Avenue**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3902-09 (Final) for a proposed remodel of an existing single-family dwelling, including a 25 sq. ft. addition to the front entry, realignment of front concrete stairs, window and door replacements, plaster over existing brick façade, and new concrete rear patio.

Applicant: Robert C. Mein, Architect on behalf of Ken and Susan Lopez

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption  
Recommended Architectural Review Guidelines: 6, 28, 32, 33, 34, 35, and 36  
Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP  
Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action.

Senior Planner Karen Vaughn introduced the project.

Applicant Robert Mein presented the project and responded to questions from the Board.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

**On a motion by Hinshaw, seconded by Northrop, the Board voted 5-0 (Aeschliman abstained) to grant Final Architectural Approval, pursuant to Architectural Review Guideline No. 1.**

**BOARD MEMBER AESCHLIMAN RETURNED TO HER SEAT.**

**f. Project Address: 1212 Forest Avenue**

Architectural Approval Application No. 3914-09 and Sign Permit No. 09-0173 for a proposed 1,052 sq. ft. addition to the front of the existing structure, paving and planter improvements, removal of 1,642 sq. ft. of paved area, removal of 18 parking spaces, landscaping and signage improvements.

Applicant: Ray Parks, on behalf of Safeway, Inc.

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Associate Planner, Karen Vaughn AICP

Recommended action: Discuss and take appropriate action.

Senior Planner Karen Vaughn introduced the project.

Applicant Ray Parks presented the project and responded to questions from the Board.

The public comment period was opened, no public comment was received.

Mary Weaver, landscape architect, responded to questions about the landscaping during the Board's discussion.

**On a motion by Edmonds, seconded by Becom, the Board voted 6-0 to grant Final Architectural Approval for the project.**

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Becom, the Board voted 6-0 to grant Final Approval of the Sign Permit Application.**

**15. REPORTS OF BOARDMEMBERS**

None

**16. REPORTS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT**

Senior Planner Karen Vaughn announced the special City Council planning session to be held on December 17, 2009 from 5-9 p.m. at the Community Center.

Senior Planner Karen Vaughn requested that the December 22, 2009 meeting be canceled due to the holidays.

**On a motion by Howe, seconded by Becom, the Board voted 6-0 to cancel the December 22, 2009 ARB meeting.**

**17. ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 9:15 p.m.