



CITY OF PACIFIC GROVE

300 FOREST AVENUE
PACIFIC GROVE, CALIFORNIA 93950
TELEPHONE (831) 648-3190 • FAX (831) 648-3184

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING

ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

DATE & TIME: TUESDAY, DECEMBER 9, 2008 – 6:00 P.M.

LOCATION: CITY HALL, COUNCIL CHAMBERS – 300 FOREST AVENUE

1. CALL TO ORDER

The meeting commenced at 6:03 p.m.

2. ROLL CALL

Architectural Review Board (ARB) Members present:

Jeff Becom

Darlene Billstrom

Ken Hinshaw

Doug Howe, Chair

Maryanne Larson Spradling, Vice Chair

Wilda Northrop

Staff in attendance:

Karen Vaughn, Senior Planner

Sarah Hardgrave, Senior Planner

Lynn Burgess, AICP, Chief Planner

3. APPROVAL OF MINUTES

Minutes from the November 25, 2008, Regular ARB Site Review and Regular Meeting were reviewed by the Board.

→ **On a motion by Northrop/Billstrom, the Board voted 6-0 to approve the November 25, 2008 ARB site review and regular meeting minutes.**

4. COMMENTS FROM THE PUBLIC

None.

5. COMMUNICATIONS

- a. **Upcoming holiday schedule:** The December 23, 2008 regular ARB meeting was previously cancelled; however, a request has been made to reinstate the December 23, 2008 meeting.

→ **On a motion by Howe/Northrop, the Board voted 6-0 to reinstate the December 23, 2008 hearing.**

- b. Please note that the first regularly scheduled ARB meeting of the new year is **Tuesday January 13, 2009**, and was misstated as being January 6, 2008 at the last meeting.

6. WRITTEN CORRESPONDENCE

None.

7. CITY COUNCIL ACTIONS

Senior Planner Hardgrave reported that the City Council held its first reading of the Old Bath House lease agreement on December 3, 2008, and will have the second reading on December 17, 2008.

8. PLANNING COMMISSION ACTIONS

Senior Planner Hardgrave reported that the Planning Commission heard an appeal of an ARB denial of proposed window design changes for project address 957 Syida and had approved vinyl windows with exterior muntins, as presented by the applicant at the Planning Commission meeting.

9. SUBCOMMITTEE REPORTS

Senior Planner Hardgrave reported that additional materials for the Old Bath House project had been received and reviewed by the subcommittee, and that the consideration of the submittal materials will be brought back to the full ARB on December 23, 2008.

10. ADMINISTRATIVE ARCHITECTURAL APPROVALS

Administrative Hearing was held on Monday December 1, 2008. Administrative architectural approval was received for the following projects:

- a. 305 Lighthouse Avenue Administrative Architectural Approval No. 08-187 to allow expansion of utility rooms within an existing carport.

11. ITEMS WITHDRAWN OR TABLED

None.

12. REQUESTS FOR CONTINUANCE

None.

13. CONSENT AGENDA

None.

14. REGULAR AGENDA

a. Project Address: 245 Ocean View Boulevard (HRI)

Architectural Approval Application No. 3822-08 for review of exterior siding detail for a single family dwelling on the City of Pacific Grove Historic Resources Inventory, approved by the ARB on October 14, 2008 with a subcommittee, referred back to the full ARB due to lack of concurrence on the subcommittee submittal.

Applicant: Michael and Stephanie Beckwith

CEQA status: Class 31 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Sarah Hardgrave

Senior Planner Hardgrave presented the project and identified the applicable Secretary of Interior Standards and Guidelines for Historic Structures regarding exterior wood materials for the ARB to consider in their review of the project.

Michael Beckwith, applicant, presented the project and answered questions from the Board. No further public comment was received.

The Board discussed concerns regarding the window trim and how it would work with a thicker lap siding as proposed by the applicant. The Board also discussed the Secretary of the Interior Standards.

→ **On a motion by Billstrom/Spradling, the Board voted 5-1 (Hinshaw dissenting) to approve the project as presented to utilize wood lap siding without tapering, since it conveys the same visual appearance as the original siding consistent with the Secretary of Interior Standards and Guidelines for replacement of exterior wood features. Architectural approval is based on the standard findings and conditions for approval of an architectural approval application.**

b. Project Address: 1169 Presidio Boulevard

Architectural Approval Application No. 3797-08 for review of carport details for a project approved by the ARB on October 28, 2008, which had been referred to subcommittee. Referred back to full ARB by subcommittee due to lack of concurrence on subcommittee submittal.

Applicant: Ted Larson, on behalf of Dave Gross

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn

Senior Planner Vaughn presented the project along with relevant Architectural Review Guidelines #13, #37 & #38 by which to review the project.

Ted Larson, applicant, presented the project to and answered questions from the Board. No further public comment was received.

The Board discussed concerns regarding the materials and structure, and stated its hesitance to set a precedent for this type of structure.

- **On a motion by Hinshaw/Northrop, the Board voted 6-0 to continue the project to the January 13, 2009 hearing in order for the applicant to revise the carport plans. The motion was based on Architectural Review Guidelines #4, #37 & #38.**

c. Project Address: 1007 Hillside Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3774-08 and Tree Permit Application No. 2008327 for proposed new two-story single family dwelling, and removal of 19 trees.

Applicant: Steven Krebs, on behalf of Bart Jovellana

CEQA Status: Class 3 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Sarah Hardgrave

Senior Planner Hardgrave presented the project along with relevant Architectural Review Guidelines #34, #35, #36, #37, #38 & #40 by which to review the project.

Derek Siemens, architect, presented the project to and answered questions from the Board. No further public comment was received.

The Board discussed maintenance of the proposed gravel roof and issues concerning the proposed railing. Board members noted that a lot of thought has gone into this project and expressed their appreciation to the architect.

- **On a motion by Becom/Billstrom, the Board voted 4-2 (Spradling and Northrop dissenting) to approve the project as presented. Architectural approval is based on the standard findings and conditions for approval of an architectural approval application, and the appeal period for this project is 5 days. The motion was based on Architectural Review Guidelines #34, #36, #37 & #40.**

d. Project Address: 622 17th Street

Architectural Approval Application No. 3805-08 for proposed first and second story additions and remodel to an existing single family dwelling.

Applicant: Ron Brown, on behalf of Gerald D. Noland

CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn

Senior Planner Vaughn presented the project along with relevant Architectural Review Guidelines #1, #6, #9, #24, #25, #28 & #32 by which to review the project.

Ron Brown, applicant, addressed the board and requested a continuance to the next ARB hearing due to questions regarding the conclusions outlined in the Phase 1 Historic Assessment.

Diana Dennis (public) spoke about the proposed project, stating that the project doesn't meet any of the guidelines outlined by staff and that the project doesn't fit well with the rest of the homes on the street. Ms. Dennis feels that the project proposes too much mass for such a narrow lot, and that the mass is pushed too far forward on the lot.

Vince Tuminello (public) spoke about the proposed project, stating that the streetscape previously consisted of single-family stucco style homes and that too many houses are vying for views of the bay.

The Board closed the public comment and discussed whether the ARB should address the merits of the Phase 1 Assessment, or whether it should be referred directly to the HRC.

→ **On a motion by Howe/Becom, the Board voted 6-0 to refer the project to the Historic Resources Committee for review of the Phase 1 Historic Assessment.**

Senior Planner Vaughn noted that the next regularly scheduled HRC meeting is Wednesday, January 14, 2009.

e. Project Address: 119 Monterey Avenue

Architectural Approval Application No. 3796-08 to demolish existing garage and construct a 384 square foot addition to a single family dwelling.

Applicant: Eddie Hurt, on behalf of Geoff Underwood and Marion Marshall

***CEQA status: Class 1 Categorical Exemption*

Staff reference: Senior Planner, Karen Vaughn

Senior Planner Vaughn presented the project along with relevant Architectural Review Guidelines #27, #28, #32 & #39 by which to review the project. Also, made a correction for the record that this project does not qualify for a CEQA categorical exemption, but had a Mitigated Negative Declaration prepared, which was adopted by the HRC on November 12, 2008.

Eddie Hurt, applicant, presented the project to, and answered questions from, the Board. No further public comment was received.

The Board discussed concerns in not having full plans to review and asked that full plan sets be prepared and submitted for future projects.

→ **On a motion by Howe/Becom, the Board voted 5-1 (Spradling dissenting) to approve the project as presented by the applicant. Architectural approval is based on the standard findings and conditions for approval of an architectural approval application, and the appeal period for this project is 5 days. The motion was based on Architectural Review Guidelines #27, #28, #32, #38 & #39.**

15. REPORTS OF BOARDMEMBERS

Board member Becom asked questions regarding window issues at 419 Congress Avenue. Becom and Hinshaw reported that the two historic windows that were to be salvaged and reinstalled were not retained. Chief Planner Burgess responded and noted that she would review the ARB action on this project and speak with the property owner.

16. REPORTS OF THE COMMUNITY DEVELOPMENT DEPARTMENT

None.

17. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned at 7:53 p.m.

DRAFT