

City of Pacific Grove  
Beautification & Natural Resources Committee  
**Minutes of Meeting – September 22, 2009**

Present: Committee members: Akeman, Myers, Anton, Kapp, Phillips, Travaille

Staff: Martinez, Katen

Guest: Bruce Obbink, Sally Moore, Barbara Thomas, Mary Craft, Jessie Bray, Sally Herrgott, Pat Herrgott, Bruce Cowan, Terry O'Connell, Mary O'Connell, Georgia Booth, Bill Kampe, Carmelita Garcia

1. The meeting was called to order at 4:00 pm in the Education Room of the Library
2. **Oral Communications:**  
Barbara Thomas asked about repairs to the median island planters.  
Bruce Cowan stated there were volunteer opportunities with regard to the elimination of pampas grass. He is pursuing assistance from the fire department.  
Sally Moore noted the sidewalk repair and tree removal slated for the theater area and the removal of a cypress tree at Alder and Sinex  
Closed Public Comment
3. **Approval of minutes:**  
Mr. Myers made a correction to the minutes regarding the Ron Johnston notation.  
Motion to approve Mr. Akeman, Second Mr. Kapp - Approved 5 ayes
4. **Old Business**
  - A. Enforcement/compliance of replanting trees- Nothing was reported
  - B. McIndoo Estate – Staff reported the first draft of the Lighthouse/Forest Ave. intersection improvements. Ms. Anton asked who was reviewing the Lighthosue Preservation Plan. Mr. Myers stated he has spoken with the members of the Lighthouse Heritage Society.
  - C. Fog Horn Building – Mr. Phillips had nothing to report.
  - D. Tree Ordinance  
Recommended Action 1: Approve addition to Article I. Findings and Purpose, 12.16.010 #9  
Staff distributed the recommended wording for the addition to Article I,  
No Public comment  
Motion to adopt the new Finding #9 by Mr. Akeman, Seconded by Mr. Kapp  
Unanimous ayes

Recommended Action 2: Review Article V: Staff reported to the committee the issues as brought to the committee and distributed an Issues sheet, and copies of the ordinance.

Public Comment was opened.

Issue #1 – Replant requirement of 2 for 1

Mrs. O'Connell asked for format clarification with regard to what line(s) in the code was being cited.

Mr. O'Connell stated that the 2 for 1 replant was an issue of increasing survivability. If one tree survives the period cited than the second tree should be allowed to be removed.

Mrs. Bray asked that the 2 for 1 issue should be addressed.

Mrs. Booth spoke to fire safety and private property management.

Mr. Kampe addressed the issue of going line by line with regard to ordinance review and whether that is an effective method. He outlined three objectives: the right tree, the right number of trees, and the right to fix problem trees. Suitable species is very important.

Mrs. Thomas also spoke to 2 for 1 and asked how the survivability rate was established. She questioned spending money for a 50% survival given the cost of trees

Mr. Cowan also shared that size of tree is important.

Public Comment was closed.

Mr. Akeman stated that 2 for 1 works in that the ordinance states "if feasible". His personal experience with public trees is a 27% survival rate.

Mr. Myers stated that planting 2 for 1 on public property is different than planting on private property. Homeowners efforts are better for maintaining a tree.

Mr. Travaille stated that the a 1 for 1 exists within the ordinance.

Motion by Mr. Akeman and second by Mr. Travaille to maintain the word "feasible", and use the language "up to two (2) trees", with a suitable species as determined "with" the City Arborist.

Motion Passed - Vote was 4 ayes and two noes.

Issue #2 – "Comparable Species" – Staff reported on the current language and some of the options available to the committee.

Public Comment was opened.

Mr. O'Connell stated that a property owner should be able to choose a tree from the tree list.

Mrs. Booth stated that certain species required by the arborist are not available to homeowners to purchase. Trees should be proportionally appropriate.

Mr. Cowan stated that the Bishop pine is a native and not the best choice for a residence but that it has a slow rate of growth.

Mrs. Moore stated that there are trees on the tree list that are not appropriate (for residential property).

Mr. Kampe addressed the word comparable. He referenced the issue of homeowners can have problems with a tree planted by previous owners.

The arborist has the ability to offer quite a bit of advice.  
Mrs. O'Connell addressed the broad definition of "feasible"  
Mrs. Bray addressed the order of the discussion.  
Closed Public Comment  
Mr. Myers suggested expanding the tree list.  
Mr. Phillips spoke to the development having impinged on the forest, hence large trees in residential areas.  
Mr. Travaille stated that sectors for tree types may not be practical.  
Discussion on comparable to suitable trees. Committee was in agreement this will require less pine tree replants.  
Mr. Akeman stated that the pine species is important to our area.  
Mr. Travaille spoke to the diminishing pine forest.  
Committee agreed to have staff prepare some language that addresses the community's concern with regard to "comparable" and addresses the need for cooperative decisions with the city arborists.  
Issue #3 was in this discussion.  
Issue #4 12.16.200 (C) 9 – Staff reported  
Public Comment was opened  
Mrs. Booth stated there needs to be cooperation with the nurseries so the public knows what is available.  
Mrs. O'Connell asked about the status of the landscape tree list.  
Mr. Cowan talked about specific species.  
Mr. Kampe stated the tree list should be a tool and a companion to the ordinance.  
Mr. Obbink asked about process and a property owner's recourse for a change.  
Motion by Mr. Kapp, second by Mr. Travaille to change language of 12.16.200 (c) 9 as suggested by staff.  
Unanimous.  
Issue #3 was re-opened to allow for public comment  
Mrs. Moore would like to see an open process with appointments with the arborist and discussion about re plants.  
Mrs. Thomas would like to see good public relationships with the arborist.  
Closed Public Comment

**E. BID** – Nothing to report.

**F. Goals** – Ms. Anton reported that the Bridge Ministry will be painting the upper Forest Ave. light pole.

### **5. New Business**

**A:** Tree report. Mr. Akeman commented that the number of trims and removals is consistent with our current trend and time of year.

**B.** Nuisance Garbage was not discussed pending a report from the fire marshal.

**9. Adjournment** Motion by Mr. Akeman seconded by Mr. Philips at 6:05pm.  
Unanimous in favor.