

MINUTES OF REGULAR MEETING

NATURAL RESOURCES COMMISSION

DATE & TIME: TUESDAY, OCTOBER 25, 2011
LOCATION: City Council Chambers
300 Forest Avenue, Pacific Grove CA

Commissioners present: Dave Myers, Scott Hall, Delores Mollring, Al Saxe
Barbara Thomas
Excused absence: Frances Grate
Absent: Jay Tulley

MEETING AGENDA:

1. Call to Order

Chair Dave Myers called the meeting to order at 4:05pm

2. Oral Communications

None

3. Commissioner & Staff Announcements

Dave Myers remarked it was nice to return home and see the foghorn building was gone.

Mike Zimmer said members of the Community requested some sort of commemorative plaque be put where the foghorn once stood, and he has asked them for input on it. He added the restoration project on the golf course will also take place at the former foghorn site.

Dave Myers asked Mr. Zimmer if he had talked to Mr. Frutchey about the role of the NRC regarding the Monarch Sanctuary and Lighthouse.

Barbara Thomas asked if Staff could write down what they have in mind for these NRC roles for future discussion. Mr. Myers requested this be clarified before finalizing our Charters and Duties.

Mike Zimmer will agendize it for the next meeting and have some written proforma from Mr. Frutchey regarding his understanding of what the NRC roles are for the Lighthouse and Sanctuary.

4. Approval of Minutes from September 27, 2011 meeting

Scott Hall pointed out the misspelling of Prebble Potter's name.

A motion to approve the minutes as amended was made by Al Saxe and seconded by Scott Hall. Vote 5-0

5. Old Business – Item 6 B heard first

Chair announced that Sarah Hardgrave requested this item be moved up.

Environmental Programs Manager, Sarah Hardgrave, said although people are eager to receive the public review draft of the UFMP, she regretted it was not quite ready for publication. She gave everyone a copy of her PowerPoint presentation to Council on October 5, 2011. She explained that the UFMP document will have 6 Chapters, including an introduction, a discussion of the existing City urban forest, over-arching guiding principles and strategies, the longer term initiatives and strategies and the future Urban Forestry Standards.

The concept that the consultant team has put forward is to move a lot of what is in the current code into a management document. The ordinance would be much shorter and streamlined so it would not be as difficult for the public to use. The tree ordinance itself would be a procedural document.

She said Council direction was to have the UFAC (Urban Forest Advisory Committee) spend more time with the document, so she is planning to have a UFAC meeting on November 8 and anticipates needing more than one meeting to review the document. She is hoping the document will be released to the public next week.

The UFAC will recommend the document to the NRC and the NRC will recommend it to City Council.

Scott Hall said he just learned from Tom Frutchey during a recent DPIC (Downtown Public Improvement Committee) meeting that his committee's project is a small chapter of the UFMP document. He wondered if the document being prepared by Dee, and which they have been reviewing, is ultimately going to be inserted into the UFMP.

Ms. Hardgrave said what the DPIC is working on is a very specific task focusing on Lighthouse Avenue improvements and goes far beyond what is in the UFMP. It is part of the UFMP Green Corridor Initiative. One of the goals is to re-establish the level of the canopy we had 25 years ago. Green Corridors will be established on key streets throughout town and is one of the mechanisms to help reforest the City.

In answer to Dave Myer's question whether the tree ordinance followed this document or the two were done simultaneously, she stated they were being done simultaneously.

Dave Myers also asked how the CEQA review dovetailed with the rest of it. Ms. Hardgrave stated the CEQA document will be prepared after the public review draft has been circulated for review. It is important, just in terms of managing the consultants' budget, that Staff doesn't have them spend any time on the CEQA document until they have the actual project, which is the plan itself.

Mr. Myers remarked that after reading the editorial and letters in the Bulletin, that he was concerned that the plan so far and what's been presented to Council seems to fly in the face of what has happened regarding the tree ordinance in the past couple of years. He asked how are the proposed changes in the tree ordinance being dealt with in this process. Sarah said that is what is taking a little more time is making sure the Consultants are really reflecting where things stood from the previous review of the ordinance and that the Standards in Chapter 5 of the plan reflect the input that has been previously received.

Sarah stated that in her humble opinion it is unfortunate that the *PG Bulletin* and some community members chose to take a stand before seeing the UFMP document. She thinks there is a lot of good stuff in this plan and it is important that the document reflect public opinion. She felt it was premature for the *PG Bulletin* to take this stance before the document was out. She stated the ordinance needs to go hand in hand with the plan and we need to make sure the ordinance gets out at the exact same time as the plan.

Al Saxe commented that as a member of the *PG Bulletin*, he is very much in favor of planning, very much in favor of changing the attitude in this town that TREE is a four letter word and thinks one way to do it is by having good community input and good answers and transparency. Sarah agreed. He believes his job is and his position is to put as much information in the public's hands so that they can help you and the City deal with it and come up with a good solution. He does not feel this is an adversarial position.

Barbara Thomas stated that as far as she knew there were only 2 UFAC meetings not 3, and was glad to know of the new UFAC date.

Per Sarah's comment regarding the *PG Bulletin*, she stated she was present at Sarah's presentation to Council. She thought the Council members who aren't involved in street planning, and the public, including herself as a UFAC member, was shocked to see it was three parts street and one part tree. The original deal with RBF was supposed to be a tree ordinance and working urban forest management plan that passes CEQA. She added that most of this a great, huge plan that Sarah and Mr. Frutchey have been working on for over a year, but it is not what the Council or the public thought she was going to do. She was shocked by what's going on and how it is being done and hoped the direction of this changed.

Dave Myers asked if there would be another community meeting. Ms. Thomas interrupted that she hoped there wouldn't be another one if there is going to be like the other community meetings in which the answers and results were the same except for the addition of the terms like storm water. Unless it is a community meeting in which there is going to be a change in what is going on, she believed it a waste of Council's time, the public's time, and everyone's time.

Sarah replied that once there is a draft ready to review, the dynamics would change. She understood why the change of dates and times was difficult for people.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Georgia Booth stated she stood by her letter in the *PG Bulletin* which was read at the OCT 5th Council Meeting. From her perspective, the first four pages of the PowerPoint document is what has been holding up the completion of the project. She said it is not the Urban Forest Management Plan, not the complimentary tree ordinance & not the CEQA review holding this plan up. This all has been pretty well explored at the community & Consultants' level. She said there was great concern when the Council approved this agreement at the cost of about \$121,000, but that she assured everyone these three prongs of the agreement were worth our money of about \$7.75 per person in the City. It is the first four pages of this that are add-ons to the original agreement with the Consultants that is bogging us down. She said this is a great vision, but at this point in the City's fiscal state, it is countermanding or almost defeating the agreement.

It was not the Consultants' lack of commitment to this project. She believes everything except the PowerPoint pages 5 and 6 should be eliminated.

Barbara Thomas wanted to know if the UFMP goal of planting "nearly 1,000 trees" per year for 25 years meant a combination of planting on private and public property.

Ms. Hardgrave replied yes.

Dave Myers said we won't plan on taking on any action on this at our next meeting

A. Commission Charter and Duties

It was decided this item would be put on next month's agenda

B. Ad Hoc Arbor Day

Al Saxe reported since the last meeting the Community School tree planting project has born great results. The first shipment of over 300 Monterey pine seedlings from Pebble Beach Company will arrive next week. A concern voiced by Thom Akeman and others who have tried this before was that once the trees were planted in good faith, they weren't watered continuously for three years thereafter; subsequently most have died.

Mark Kennedy of Kennedy Brothers Agricultural Company in Salinas has donated a 100 gallon water tank, pump and hoses to the school for use in the whole community so that can go on the back of a pick-up and trees can be watered in a timely manner. The school district is going to recognize Mr. Kennedy for this generous donation.

Also, Mike Zimmer and his staff has given Al an aerial map of the entire city so that it can be enlarged and Mike can identify places where the trees can be planted.

Al is trying to get recycled water from Pebble Beach Co, otherwise he will approach Cal Am.

He added that Input is needed from this Commission. Other groups and individuals are very interested in this project and there needs to be discussion about the size of the project.

Scott Hall asked about ownership and liability of the tank and Al replied it will be given to the Community School. The students will always have adult supervision in regard to who is driving the truck. Tom Moss and Eric Love will be advising re growing and planting techniques. He hoped NRC members might help with driving the truck.

Dave Myers asked about plans for an official Arbor Day celebration. Barbara Thomas said she spoke to Councilman Cuneo at the last Council meeting and said she and Al would be contacting him (and Mayor Garcia) next month about his/their ideas regarding a formal celebration. Don Mothershead will also be contacted.

Scott Hall mentioned there was going to be an Arbor Day open house at the Sunset Center in Carmel. He kindly agreed to go, get any information that might be pertinent to and useful for the Ad hoc Committee and NRC.

Mike Zimmer said he is excited about the project becoming part of the students' curriculum and passed on through the next generations of students. Mike will be doing a GPS on each tree (its type and planting date) so that survival rates can be tracked. This is also being done for replants throughout the City.

C. Downtown Recycling Container Presentation

Dave Myers, with Scott Hall on video/computer, showed examples of recycling containers from Dave's archives. One was a Victorian-looking container that had possibilities of fitting into the look of downtown, but they had not settled on anything yet.

Mrs. Thomas asked if they had inquired about the cost of the Monterey containers and Dave replied they cost \$1,600-\$1,700 apiece. He added that Monterey's budget is much bigger than ours and that is why they are able to have containers all over the city. Mrs. Thomas also asked if they would like help from other members, then asked how many people could be on an Ad hoc.

Mr. Zimmer said he would report back on this issue.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

SALLY MOORE suggested skirts like the ones that can be put around 5 gallon buckets.

Dave said there are smaller containers that hang over or on the sides or on light poles. He thought this was a good suggestion.

Dave and Scott will continue their work on this project

D. Downtown Public Improvement Committee

Scott Hall said they met last Wednesday, Oct. 12th, after a month and a half. Most of the meeting was about where they were in the woods. When he showed up, the members asked Tom Frutchey what their role was because they were wondering if they were part of the UFMP. Sarah Hardgrave's presentation earlier in the meeting had clarified their role for him.

They are still discussing whether to use pavers or stamped concrete for cross walks and will make a recommendation to Council. They have given the City ideas about the planter bump-outs. However, their plans will not work unless the City has a buy in as far as watering and maintenance.

Dave asked if they had discussed recycling. Scott said no, but he would like the Recycling Ad hoc Committee to decide on a couple of containers and follow through on getting them to implement it.

In response to a question from Scott Hall, Mr. Zimmer said the DPIC could move forward with their Forest and Lighthouse project in tandem with the development of the Urban Forest Management Plan.

Delores Mollring asked about the percentage of trash versus recycling. Since there is usually more garbage than recyclable material, maybe the side-hanging containers might be appropriate.

Mr. Zimmer said what he was hearing is that it would be in the Commission's best interests to come up with a couple of design choices.

6. New Business

A. Appointment of Liaison to assist recreation Commission

Scott Hall announced that Bill Peake from the Rec Board was in the audience. He said Bill is looking for Commissioners and Board members willing to work on their trail improvement project..

Al Saxe and Scott Hall both volunteered to join the Sub-committee group.

Bill explained the group is in the preliminary stages and hopes to generate some ideas and suggestions on how to move it forward.

Scott Hall asked Mike Zimmer if he thought this would have to go out to a design firm or consultants for a CEQA report, etc.. Mike replied that depending on the sophistication of the design features, it could require a CEQA review or a waiver. According to Mr. Peake, Tom Moss said it would definitely have to go before the Coastal Commission.

For now, Bill said he thought to begin with they could look at three different cases, develop definitions of those cases and get broader input. He is planning to talk to the Traffic Commission next for possible sub-committee volunteers.

A motion was made by Barbara Thomas to appoint Al Saxe and Scott Hall to join the Recreation Board Sub-committee to work on the Recreation Trail upgrade; seconded by Delores Mollring. Vote 5-0.

B. UFMP Presentation (given earlier in the meeting)

C. NRC Project Status

The Tree Ordinance was discussed earlier by Sarah Hardgrave

Rocky Shores Trail has been completed.

Newspaper racks Mr. Zimmer said he did talk to Mr. Kavoosi ,who said he has approval from 4 or 5 of the vendors. Mike has asked Mr. Kavoosi to call him when he purchases the racks. The City will install them at no charge to the vendors.

Foghorn has been removed.

NRC Info on Website is still on hold according to Mr.Becklenberg.

Barbara Thomas said Delores Mollring's name was still not online and Pat Reedy's remains. She asked for clarification on which office was responsible for posting NRC meetings and said that the present meeting/agenda hadn't been posted online, but that ARB's and the Recreation Board's were posted.

Mr. Zimmer said that according to the City Attorney, the meeting was only required to be posted at City Hall. However, he would follow up on making sure NRC meetings were posted online in the future.

Scott Hall asked whether the website design had been dropped because of funding

which he thought had been in the amount of \$65,000.

Mr. Zimmer will follow up with Mr. Becklenberg regarding Mr. Hall's inquiry.

D. Monthly Tree Summary

Mike Zimmer has followed up on the MacDonalds replanting that should have been done for a previous permit. Their current permit is for trimming only.

Barbara Thomas asked if it was possible to put a key on the bottom of the sheet so these summaries can be printed on 8.5 X 11 sheets of paper.

PUBLIC COMMENT:

Lydia Collins, (ARB), whose property is listed on the tree permit summary, stated she had two trees removed and, technically, has to replant four, even though her lot won't support that many trees.

Mike Zimmer told her to call Public Works. Possible options are in lieu fees or having her lot re-evaluated.

She feels it unduly punishes her for having to plant too many trees for the space or paying in lieu fees. She believes people should have to apply for a permit to plant trees because she looks at them in terms of structures that affect her house and neighbors' houses and yards.

Mr. Zimmer told her to come to Public Works with her concerns.

7. Sub-committee reports

None

8. Agenda items for next meeting

Tree permit application was added

9. Adjournment

Meeting ended at 6pm because Commissioner Thomas was talking too much

Respectfully submitted,

B Thomas
Secretary